Award FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution

In the Matter of the Arbitration Between:

Claimants Case Number: 16-01018

Myrna Barzelatto Myrna Wendlinger Family Limited Partners Herbert Pfeffer

VS.

Respondent Hearing Site: New York, New York

Spire Securities, LLC

Consolidated with

<u>Claimants</u> <u>Case Number</u>: 17-01361

David Freilicher William Bernstein

vviillam Bernstein

Hal Nass Ellen Nass

Lawrence Eisner

Amy Eisner

Robert Skollar

Holla4, LLC

Marc Hyman

Kirstine Schaeffer

John Skalicky

Jean Schram

Richard Schram

Paul Posnick

Helene Posnick

Robert Gluckin

Estate of Joan B. Gluckin

Thomas Herrmann

Carolyn Herrmann

HFP Holdings, LLC

Lynn Bruce on behalf of Betty Ziernicki Trust

VS.

Respondents Hearing Site: New York, New York

Spire Securities, LLC Suzanne Marie McKeown

David Lloyd Blisk

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 2 of 9

Nature of the Dispute: Customers vs. Member, and Associated Persons

This case was decided by a majority-public panel.

REPRESENTATION OF PARTIES

<u>16-010</u>18

For Claimants Myrna Barzelatto, Myrna Wendlinger Family Limited Partners, and Herbert Pfeffer: Adam Gana, Gana LLP, New York, New York.

For Respondent Spire Securities, LLC: Paul A. Lieberman, Esq., Scarinci & Hollenbeck, LLC, Red Bank, New Jersey.

17-01361

For Claimants David Freilicher, William Bernstein, Hal Nass, Ellen Nass, Lawrence Eisner, Amy Eisner, Robert Skollar, Holla4, LLC, Marc Hyman, Kirstine Schaeffer, John Skalicky, Jean Schram, Richard Schram, Paul Posnick, Helene Posnick, Robert Gluckin, Estate of Joan B. Gluckin, Thomas Herrmann, Carolyn Herrmann HFP Holdings, LLC, Lynn Bruce on behalf of Betty Ziernicki Trust: Adam J. Weinstein, Gana LLP, New York, New York.

For Respondents Spire Securities, LLC, Suzanne Marie McKeown, and David Lloyd Blisk: Paul A. Lieberman, Esq., Scarinci & Hollenbeck, LLC, Red Bank, New Jersey.

CASE INFORMATION

16-01018

Statement of Claim filed on or about: April 4, 2016.

Myrna Barzelatto signed the Submission Agreement: April 4, 2016.

Myrna Wendlinger Family Limited Partners signed the Submission Agreement: April 4, 2016.

Herbert Pfeffer signed the Submission Agreement: April 4, 2016.

Statement of Answer filed by Respondent on or about: July 15, 2016. Spire Securities, LLC signed the Submission Agreement: December 14, 2016.

17-01361

Statement of Claim filed on or about: May 24, 2017.

David Freilicher signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

William Bernstein signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Hal Nass signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Ellen Nass signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Lawrence Eisner signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Amy Eisner signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Robert Skollar signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Holla4, LLC signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Marc Hyman signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Kirstine Schaeffer signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 3 of 9

John Skalicky signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Jean Schram signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Richard Schram signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Paul Posnick signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Helene Posnick signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Robert Gluckin signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Estate of Joan B. Gluckin signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Thomas Herrmann signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Carolyn Herrmann signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

HFP Holdings, LLC signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Lynn Bruce on behalf of Betty Ziernicki Trust signed the Submission Agreement: May 24, 2017.

Joint Statement of Answer filed by Respondents on or about: July 14, 2017. Spire Securities, LLC signed the Submission Agreement: July 13, 2017. Suzanne Marie McKeown signed the Submission Agreement: July 13, 2017. David Lloyd Blisk signed the Submission Agreement: July 13, 2017.

CASE SUMMARY

16-01018

Claimants asserted the following causes of action: failure to supervise, negligent or intentional misstatements, control person liability, respondeat superior, unsuitability, overconcentration, violation of FINRA Rule 2210, 2010, 2020 and IM-2310-2, negligent or fraudulent misrepresentations and omissions in violation of federal and state securities law. The causes of action relate to various securities purchased by Claimants.

Unless specifically admitted in the Statement of Answer, Respondents denied the allegations made in the Statement of Claim and asserted various affirmative defenses.

17-01361

Claimants asserted the following causes of action: failure to supervise, negligent or intentional misstatements, control person liability, respondeat superior, overconcentration, unsuitability, negligent or fraudulent misrepresentations and omissions in violation of federal and state securities law. The causes of action relate to various securities purchased by Claimants.

Unless specifically admitted in the Statement of Answer, Respondents denied the allegations made in the Statement of Claim and asserted various affirmative defenses.

RELIEF REQUESTED

16-01018

In the Statement of Claim, Claimants requested compensatory damages for a sum of \$300,000.00; interest at the statutory rate; attorneys' fees; expert fees; forum fees; punitive damages and such other and further relief as this Panel deems just and proper.

In the Statement of Answer, Respondents requested that Claimants' claims be dismissed with prejudice; award for attorneys' fees and costs.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 4 of 9

17-01361

In the Statement of Claim, Claimants requested compensatory damages for a sum of \$22,000,000.00; interest at the statutory rate; attorneys' fees; expert fees; forum fees; punitive damages and such other and further relief as this Panel deems just and proper.

In the Statement of Answer, Respondents requested that the Panel dismiss all claims and issue an order denying all claims for compensatory damages, interest, forum fees, and expert fees; punitive damages, attorneys' fees; award Respondent their fees, costs, attorneys' fees and expert witness fees; and grant expungement of this matter to each individual Respondent and Respondent Spire from their respective CRD event disclosures pursuant to Rule 2080.

At the close of the hearing, Claimants requested damages of \$12,304,310.00 plus interest, assessment of at least 75% of the hearing cost against Respondents and awarding \$25,589.00 in costs.

OTHER ISSUES CONSIDERED AND DECIDED

The Arbitrators acknowledge that they have each read the pleadings and other materials filed by the parties.

On or about August 22, 2016, Claimants' filed a Motion for Sanctions. On August 31, 2016, Respondent filed an Opposition to the Motion for Sanctions.

On or about November 18, 2016, Claimants' filed a Motion to Compel and Further Support of Motion for Sanctions. On November 25, 2016, Respondent filed an opposition to Claimants' Motion to Compel and Motion for Sanctions and on November 29, 2016, Claimants' filed a Reply in Further Support of their Motion to Compel and for Sanctions.

On or about July 18, 2016, Respondent filed a Motion to Dismiss pursuant to Rule 12504. On October 14, 2016, Claimant filed a Renewed Motion for Sanctions and Opposition to Motion to Dismiss and on October 20, 2016, Respondent filed a Reply in support of its Motion to Dismiss.

On November 29, 2016, the Panel heard oral arguments on Respondent's Motion to Dismiss. By Order dated November 29, 2016, the Panel denied Respondent's Motion to Dismiss. The Panel awarded attorneys' fees and costs incurred in connection to the Motion to Dismiss to Claimants.

On January 11, 2017, the Panel heard oral argument on Claimants' Motion to Compel and for Sanctions. By Order dated February 9, 2017, the Panel denied Claimants' Motion for Sanctions.

On or about July 24, 2017, Claimants' filed a Motion to Consolidate Case numbers 16-01018 and 17-01361. On August 10, 2017, Respondent filed an opposition to the Motion to Consolidate and on August 15, 2017, Claimants' filed a Reply in support of their Motion to Consolidate.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 5 of 9

On September 14, 2017, the Panel heard oral argument on Claimants' Motion to Consolidate. By Order dated September 14, 2017, the Panel granted Claimants' Motion to consolidate Case 17-01361 with Case 16-01018.

At the conclusion of Claimants case-in-chief, Respondents made a Motion to Dismiss and Claimants opposed the motion. After due deliberation, the Panel denied Respondents Motion to Dismiss.

Arbitrator Albert Rizzo dissented on the award because the Claimants' did not demonstrate entitlement as to the relief requested.

The parties present at the hearing have agreed that the Award in this matter may be executed in counterpart copies or that a handwritten, signed Award may be entered.

AWARD

After considering the pleadings, the testimony and evidence presented at the hearing, and the post-hearing submissions, the Panel has decided in full and final resolution of the issues submitted for determination as follows:

- 1. Respondents are jointly and severally liable for and shall pay to Claimants the sum of \$3,000,000.00 in compensatory damages.
- 2. Respondents' requests for expungement of their CRD records are denied.
- 3. Any and all claims for relief not specifically addressed herein, including punitive damages and attorneys' fees, are denied.

<u>FEES</u>

Pursuant to the Code of Arbitration Procedure, the following fees are assessed:

Filing Fees

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution assessed a filing fee* for each claim:

Initial Claim Filing Fee

=\$ 1,425.00

Member Fees

Member fees are assessed to each member firm that is a party in these proceedings or to the member firm that employed the associated persons at the time of the events giving rise to the dispute. Accordingly, as a party, Respondent Spire Securities, LLC is assessed the following:

Member Surcharge Member Process Fee =\$ 1,900.00

=\$ 3,750.00

^{*}The filing fee is made up of a non-refundable and a refundable portion.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 6 of 9

Postponement Fees

Postponements granted during these proceedings for which fees were assessed or waived:

June 13, July 11-13, August 8-10, September 13 &18-19, 2017 and December	,
postponement by parties =\$1	,125.00
August 14-17, 2017, postponement by parties WA	IVED
November 9, 2018, postponement by Respondent WA	IVED
February 8, 2019, postponement by Claimants. WA	IVED

Total Postponement Fees

=\$1,125.00

The Panel has assessed \$562.50 of the adjournment fees jointly and severally to Claimants.

The Panel has assessed \$562.50 of the adjournment fees jointly and severally to Respondents.

Last Minute Cancellation Fees

Fees apply when a hearing on the merits is postponed or settled within ten calendar days before the start of a scheduled hearing session:

November 9, 2018, postponement requested by Respondent.	=\$1,800.00
---	-------------

Total Last Minute Cancellation Fees

=\$1,800.00

The Panel assessed the \$1,800.00 last minute cancellation fees jointly and severally to the Respondents.

Discovery-Related Motion Fee

Fees apply for each decision rendered on a discovery-related motion.

Three (3) decisions on discovery-related motions on the papers with one (1) arbitrator @ \$200.00/decision

=\$ 600.00

Claimants submitted two discovery-related motions Respondents submitted one discovery-related motion

Total Discovery-Related Motion Fees

=\$ 600.00

The Panel has assessed \$200.00 of the discovery-related motion fees jointly and severally to Claimants.

The Panel has assessed \$400.00 of the discovery-related motion fees jointly and severally to Respondents.

Hearing Session Fees and Assessments

The Panel has assessed hearing session fees for each session conducted. A session is any meeting between the parties and the arbitrators, including a pre-hearing conference with the arbitrators, that lasts four (4) hours or less. Fees associated with these proceedings are:

Two (2) pre-hearing session Pre-hearing conferences:	•	or @ \$450.00/session 1 session	=\$ 900.00
ū	September 20, 2018	1 session	
Six (6) pre-hearing session	ns with the Panel @ \$1,	125.00/session	=\$ 6,750.00
Pre-hearing conferences:		1 session	
<u> </u>	November 29, 2016	1 session	
	January 11, 2017	1 session	
	February 16, 2017	1 session	
	July 20, 2017	1 session	
	September 14, 2017	1 session	
Six (5) pre-hearing session	ns with the Panel @ \$1,	500.00/session	=\$ 7,500.00
Pre-hearing conferences:		1 session	
_	January 30, 2018	1 session	
	August 2, 2018	1 session	
	January 11, 2019	1 session	
	February 28, 2019	1 session	
Thirty-Six (36) hearing ses	ssions @ \$1 500 00/soss	sion	=\$54,000.00
Hearing Dates:	October 22, 2018	2 sessions	=\$54,000.00
Healing Dates.	October 23, 2018	2 sessions	
	October 24, 2018	2 sessions	
	October 29, 2018	2 sessions	
	October 30, 2018	2 sessions	
	November 5, 2018	2 sessions	
	November 6, 2018	2 sessions	
	November 7, 2018	2 sessions	
	November 29, 2018	2 sessions	
	November 30, 2018	2 sessions	
	January 15, 2019	2 sessions	
	January 16, 2019	2 sessions	
	January 17, 2019	2 sessions	
	January 18, 2019	2 sessions	
	February 5, 2019	2 sessions	
	February 7, 2019	2 sessions	
	April 9, 2019	2 sessions	
	April 10, 2019	2 sessions	

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 8 of 9

The Panel has assessed \$31,612.50 of the hearing session fees, jointly and severally to Claimants.

The Panel has assessed \$37,537.50 of the hearing session fees jointly and severally to Respondents.

All balances are payable to FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution and are due upon receipt.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 9 of 9

ARBITRATION PANEL

Sandra D. Parker	- .	Non-Public Arbitrator, Presiding
· ·		Chairperson
Amy Banet	~	Public Arbitrator
Albert Rizzo		Public Arbitrator

I, the undersigned Arbitrator, do hereby affirm, pursuant to Article 7507 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules, that I am the individual described herein and who executed this instrument which is my award.

Concurring Arbitrators' Signatures	·
Sandra D. Parker Non-Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson	Signature Date
·	·
Amy Banet Public Arbitrator	Signature Date
Dissenting Arbitrator Signatures	
Albert Rizzo Public Arbitrator	Signature Date

June 20, 2019

Date of Service (For FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution office use only)

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 16-01018 Award Page 9 of 9

ARBITRATION PANEL

Sandra D. Parker	-	Non-Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson
Amy Banet Albert Rizzo	- -	Public Arbitrator Public Arbitrator
I, the undersigned Arbitrator, do here Practice Law and Rules, that I am thinstrument which is my award.	•	rsuant to Article 7507 of the Civil escribed herein and who executed this
Concurring Arbitrators' Signature	<u>es</u>	
		_
Sandra D. Parker Non-Public Arbitrator, Presiding Cha	airperson	Signature Date
Amy Banet		6/19/19
Amy Banet Public Arbitrator		Signature Date
Dissenting Arbitrator Signatures		
Albert Rizzo Public Arbitrator		Signature Date
June 20, 2019		

Date of Service (For FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution office use only)

Sandra D. Parker

ARBITRATION PANEL

Non-Public Arbitrator, Presiding

Chairperson

Amy Banet Albert Rizzo	- -	Public Arbitrator Public Arbitrator
I, the undersigned Arbitrator, do here Practice Law and Rules, that I am thinstrument which is my award.		rsuant to Article 7507 of the Civil escribed herein and who executed this
Concurring Arbitrators' Signature	<u>s</u>	
	_	
Sandra D. Parker Non-Public Arbitrator, Presiding Cha	iirperson	Signature Date
Amy Banet		Signature Date
Public Arbitrator		0. g
Dissenting Arbitrator Signatures		
Aly 5		June 19, 2019
Albert Rizzo Public Arbitrator		Signature Date
June 20, 2019 Date of Service (For FINRA Office of	 f Dispute Res	olution office use only)